

IMPACT OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT: A STUDY OF SELECTED STATE-OWNED ENTERPRISES IN EBONYI STATE

NDUKWE, Chinyere, PhD

Department of Public Administration
Ebonyi State University Abakaliki
Phone: +2348033721109
ndukwechinyere@ymail.com

AGHA, Nancy, PhD

Department of Business Management
Ebonyi State University Abakaliki
+2348033105253
nanciagha@gmail.com

&

EDE, Cyril Ede, M.Sc.

Department of Public Administration
Ebonyi State University Abakaliki
Phone: +2348104355331
edecyril@gmail.com

Abstract

The study assessed the impact of public enterprises on economic development with focus on selected state-owned enterprises in Ebonyi State. Specifically, the study examined the extent to which public enterprises have contributed to revenue generation, job creation and improved standard of living in Ebonyi State. New Public Management Theory guided the study. Descriptive survey design was adopted to study 1567 staff of selected enterprises and residents being beneficiaries. The sample size was 319 determined using Taro Yemene's and Kumar's sample allocation formulae. Judgmental sampling techniques were adopted. Data were collected from primary and secondary sources. The instrument for data collection was structured questionnaire. Data were analysed using statistical tables, mean and standard deviation. Findings revealed that public enterprises have not significantly enhanced revenue generation in Ebonyi State; public enterprises have not contributed significantly to job creation in Ebonyi State; and public enterprises have not significantly improved standard of living in Ebonyi State. The implication was that public enterprises have not significantly contributed towards economic development of Ebonyi State. Hence, the study recommended that government should adopt new public management strategy to enable state-owned enterprises generate more revenue, there is need for diversification and investment in skill development for job creation, and there is need for adequate provision of basic amenities to improve the standard of living among others.

Keywords: Public Enterprises, Economic Development, Job Creation, Revenue Generation, Standard of Living

Introduction

Over the years, the need to provide efficient and quality public goods and services for the improvement of the welfare of the citizenry and fast-track socio-economic development has been the rationale behind the establishment of public enterprises otherwise known as, state-owned enterprises, public corporations, or state corporations. Public enterprise has been referred to as government-owned establishments for the provision of public goods and services in a "businesslike" manner. Okeke, Onuorah, and Okonkwo (2016) opined that public enterprise is used in the broadest sense to mean all industrial and commercial firms, mines, utilities, transport companies, and financial intermediaries owned and/or controlled wholly or partly by the government. Public enterprises are distinguished from other government establishments because they are expected to earn most of their revenue from the sale of goods and services, be self-accounting, and have a separate legal identity. Public enterprises in the

opinion of Ojeifo and Alegbeleye (2017) were established to achieve economic development objectives including revenue generation, improved standard of living, job creation, development of infrastructure, and equitable distribution of resources among others.

Economic development in the opinion of Ikeagwu (2015) is concerned with the multi-dimensional, qualitative, and quantitative transformation of the system of production, exchange, distribution, and consumption of goods and services to improve the standard of living, revenue generation, employment generation, equitable distribution of resources, human capital development, gross domestic product and infrastructural development, in a country. It as such connotes improvement in a variety of indicators such as job creation, the standard of living, revenue generation, and human capital development among others. Public enterprise is expected to generate revenue for government to finance other infrastructural projects, create jobs, and improve standard of living of people to reduce poverty. The implication being that economic development of Ebonyi State depends to a very large extent on the ability of public enterprises to generate revenue through positive return on investments; create jobs through direct employment and acquisition of technical, vocational and business skills to guarantee full employment, provide basic amenities such as portable water, food, shelter, electricity, and roads for improved standard of living of the people.

Globally, the origin of public enterprises could be traced to the early 20th century after World War II when most nations of the world, particularly the developing nations for a variety of reasons including managing the consequences of the war, political and ideological considerations prompted the establishment of public corporations. In Africa, when most former European colonies became independent in the late 1950s and 1960s, only a few public enterprises were operating in different countries (Yamma, 2017). The public enterprise sector however developed at a tremendous pace in the immediate years after independence through the 1980s such that a huge public enterprise sector was firmly established in most countries (Ayebe, 2018). At this stage, the weakness of the private sector, lack of infrastructure, the low level of social and human development, unemployment, the urge to generate revenue, provide a substitute for a private initiative where it was not forthcoming and the unfavourable social, economic and financial environment were some of the reasons given to explain the proliferation of public enterprises in all areas of economic and social development (Kenny, 2019). Nigeria was not left out in this intervention strategy.

In Nigeria, like most African countries, the genesis of government's involvement in the establishment, ownership, and management of public enterprises could be traced to the pre-independence era. Nwali, Nwokeiwu, and Oganezi (2019) asserted that during the colonial era, colonial governments established some enterprises to provide essential services like electricity, railway, and water. The post-colonial era marked a watershed in the growth and spread of public enterprises in Nigeria. According to Kenny (2019) subsequent upon independence in 1960, it was discovered that the government needed to become involved in businesslike activities as an entrepreneur to perform some business roles, secure economic independence, and foster standard of living for the nation due largely to the absence of capable indigenous entrepreneurs with enough technical know-how and financial capacity to compete with multinational corporations operating in the country as at then. As of independence in 1960, Nigeria had about 50 public enterprises, about 200 in the 1970s, and about 1,500 in 1987 when the government began major economic reform programmes (Yamma, 2017). By the late 1990s, the government had established a large number of public enterprises in such economic activities as banking and insurance, manufacturing, transportation, oil exploration, hotel, and tourism among others. Services provided by the Nigerian Railway Corporation, Water Boards, Ports Authority, and the like, hitherto lumped within the civil service structure were restructured into autonomous entities to reduce government interference and increase their effectiveness. Kenobi (2015) cited in Abuh, Acho, and Peter (2016) observed that barren economic sectors of strategic importance were neglected by private investors due largely to inadequate technical/managerial expertise, high capital threshold, and low-profit potential were then

undertaken by the government. Similarly, large monopolistic organizations like the Nigerian National Petroleum Corporation (NNPC), the defunct Power Holding Company of Nigeria (PHCN), National Insurance Corporation of Nigeria (NICON) among others were established to control services deemed too sensitive to be left in the hands of private sector organizations, and to enable the state to participate in high-profit potential ventures and earn money for further economic development purposes.

Successive governments in Nigeria since the 1980s have expressed concerns over the dismal performance of public enterprises and as such have sought palliatives to their management problems. This necessitated the government to embark on a good number of reforms such as liquidation, privatisation, and commercialisation to channel government resources to other uses. In line with this, Anyebe (2018) wrote that the Federal Government of Nigeria in 1988 through Decree No. 25 sets up the Technical Committee on privatization and Commercialization (TCPC) charged with the responsibility of privatising and commercialising some government enterprises leading to the establishment of Bureau for Public Enterprises (BPE) to implement the programmes. Consequently, some of the big government enterprises were privatised (Kenny, 2019). Despite the introduction of those reforms, the clamour for more effective and efficient approaches to improve the performance of public enterprises has continued to thrive.

In line with the federal government's efforts at improving the management of resources, the sub-nationals such as Ebonyi State since its creation in 1996 had established several public enterprises in the State, some of which include: Ebonyi State Transport Corporation; Ebonyi State Water Corporation; Ebonyi Hotels and Suites Ltd; Ebonyi State Pipeline Production Ltd; Ebonyi State Investment and Property Company Ltd; Ebonyi State Fertilizer Plant; Ebonyi State Broadcasting Corporation; Ebonyi State Newspaper Publishing Corporation, among others. These enterprises were established to improve economic development through the provision of public utilities, creating employment opportunities, improving the standard of living, human capital development, and increasing revenue generation for the state government among others. However, Ezech, Nwibo, Umeh, and Eze (2018) had argued that despite the existence of these enterprises, the economic conditions of people in Ebonyi State appear not to have improved.

Today, Ebonyi State is regarded as one of the poorest states in Nigeria despite establishment of various state-owned enterprises that ought to change such situation. A report by the Federal Office of Statistics showed that as at 2019, 79.76% of Ebonyi people were poor (NBS, 2020). In fact, despite the huge financial investment into these corporations, Ebonyi State was rated the fourth poorest state in Nigeria and the first in South East Zone in 2020 (NBS, 2020). These State-owned enterprises ought to provide and promote access to basic needs of water, food, health, and shelter; provide gainful employment opportunities especially through skills development of the youths by prioritising job creation. It is the responsibility of state-owned enterprises to address the paucity of employment, low standard of living, and inadequacy of skills acquisition opportunities so as to reduce the rate of crimes such as child labour, street hawking, robbery, thuggery, rape, and internet fraud among others (Odo, Eze, and Onyeisi, 2016). However, it also appears that several youths in the state have not been gainfully employed, internal revenue generation by the Ebonyi State government seems to be very poor and sometimes, the least among comity of states' internal revenue generation in the country and there is seeming poor standard of living among the people. It was against this background that the study assessed the impact of public enterprises on economic development with focus on selected state-owned enterprises in Ebonyi State.

Statement of the Problem

Public enterprises were created to provide adequate, efficient, and quality public goods and services to accelerate economic development. It is however regrettable that these entities have appeared unable to deliver the desired public goods and services to foster economic development, especially in Ebonyi State. Ebonyi State today appears to be trapped in crises of deteriorating economic conditions in terms

of widespread unemployment, paucity of public utilities, poor revenue generation, and abject poverty, among others. Net returns on investment by most public enterprises seem to stand at zero or negative threshold whereas output in social service provision remains invisible.

It is common to see women and youth between the ages of 18 and 47 years with their hoes, cutlasses, shovels, and tubs waiting along some major roads and streets within Abakaliki urban centre including, Spera-in-Deo Junction Along Abakaliki-Ogoja Express Road, Kpiri-Kpiri Opposite Abakaliki Township Stadium, Ogoja Road by Vanco Junction, Water Works Road Opposite Mr. Bigg's, Rice Mile by Onuebonyi Junction to mention but a few, line up in their numbers patiently waiting to be hired for menial jobs, which includes: farm/compound clearing, bricklaying, digging or even construction works, with some attendant horror experiences and intimidation by their hirers. Most of these jobbers have families of eight (8) or more with other vulnerable dependent relatives to carter for. As such, there appears to be a poor standard of living among the people of Ebonyi State, especially in the rural areas, where basic amenities such as water, food, shelter, health, and road among others are lacking. When people lack access to these basic amenities, their living conditions are low with possible effects on other economic development variables in the state.

In terms of unemployment, many youths in the state especially the graduates of tertiary institutions are unable to gain employment. Experience over the years has revealed that seventy percent of these graduates end up roaming about the streets as a result of lack of job opportunities. The unemployment rate in Ebonyi State keeps escalating as each year comes by as a result of the continuous injection of graduates who have no jobs to do at the end of the day. This has forced many into motorcycle and tricycle riding within the state capital to make ends meet. This situation has become so pathetic because job seekers/applicants end up going back to their aged parents who have invested in them, hoping that someday, they will get back the dividends of their investments but all to no avail. Also, the youth appears not to have been engaged in the acquisition of varieties of vocational, technical, and business skills needed for entrepreneurial development and self-reliance. Unemployment appears to continue unabated as many Ebonyi youths as well as youths across the country are not provided opportunities to acquire appropriate skills that will empower them after graduation from school. Ezeh, Nwibo, Umeh and Eze (2018) observed that most youths graduated from school without the needed skills or competencies that would enable them to function in today's emerging society.

Therefore, it appears that the public enterprises in Ebonyi State are yet to improve on the economic development of the state and this has become the concern of this research. It was owing to the foregoing that the researcher assessed the impact of public enterprises on economic development with a focus on selected state-owned enterprises in Ebonyi State. In view of the stated problem, the following research questions guided the study:

1. To what extent have public enterprises enhanced revenue generation in Ebonyi State?
2. To what extent have public enterprises contributed to job creation in Ebonyi State?
3. To what extent have public enterprises improved standard of living of people in Ebonyi State?

Objectives of the Study

The study broadly assessed the impact of public enterprises on economic development with reference to selected state-owned enterprises in Ebonyi State. Specifically, the study was aimed to:

1. Determine the extent to which public enterprises have enhanced revenue generation in Ebonyi State.
2. Ascertain the extent to which public enterprises have contributed to job creation in Ebonyi State.
3. Examine the extent to which public enterprises have improved standard of living of people in Ebonyi State.

Research Hypotheses

The following research hypotheses stated in null forms were tested in the course of the research:

HO₁: Public enterprises have not significantly enhanced revenue generation in Ebonyi State.

HO₂: Public enterprises have not contributed significantly to job creation in Ebonyi State.

HO₃: Public enterprises have not significantly improved standard of living of people in Ebonyi State.

Conceptual Review

Public Enterprises

Public enterprise otherwise known as public corporation, state-owned enterprise or statutory corporation, like most management science concepts defies a consensual conceptualization as each scholar perceive the concept from different angles. However, common view among scholars, institutions and practitioners has it that public enterprises are government-owned establishments for the provision of public goods and services in a “businesslike” manner. The view above was corroborated by Ademolekun (2002) cited in Emeh (2012) who rightly asserted that a public enterprise is an establishment that is set up as a corporate body and as part of the governmental apparatus for entrepreneurial or entrepreneur-like objectives. Implicit in the definition above is that public enterprises are set up by government, and they are entrepreneurial and pursue economic objectives of government. However, the definition is too parochial as it failed to accommodate the social orientations of public enterprises.

In view of the shortcomings of the above views, a more comprehensive definition was offered by the United Nations Division for Public Administration (2008) cited in Kenny (2019) where it considered public enterprise as an organization established by the government under public or private law, as a legal personality. It further observed that such enterprise is self-governing or semi-autonomous, produces/provides goods and services on a full or partial self-financing basis, and in which the government or a public body/agency participates by way of having shares or representation in its decision-making structure. The definition above seems all encompassing as it succinctly captured the basic features of public enterprises. A take-away from the definition is that a public enterprise is an institution operating a service of an economic or social character, on behalf of the government, but as an independent legal entity, largely autonomous in its management, though responsible to the public, through the government and the parliament and subject to some direction by the government, equipped on the other hand with independent and separate funds and the legal and commercial attributes of a commercial enterprise. While governments have adopted numerous strategies to promote the transfer of activities from the public to the private sector, there is a widely held belief that essential basic services like health, education, water, electricity and transportation should remain as public enterprises. It was for this reason that Ezeudu (2011) offered a more pragmatic view of public enterprises.

Ezeudu (2011) in her view described public enterprise as an institution or organization, that is owned by the state or in which the state holds a majority interest, whose activities are of a business nature and which provides service or produce goods and have their own distinct management. Implied in the definition above is that a public enterprise is an entity, owned or controlled by the government, which is supposed to earn a bulk of its revenue by providing goods and services to the public. A public enterprise has a distinct legal identity and is expected to be self-accounting. Traditionally, public enterprises are found mostly in utility and the social services sectors of the economy. They are often set up by governments to provide services in the interest of the public. Their economic relevance is often predicated on the provision of social and economic infrastructures which usually exert large external effects on other sectors of the economy.

In a similar way, Agabi and Orokpo (2014) conceptualized public enterprise to mean state-owned and operated industrial, agricultural, financial or commercial venture. They further argued that, by public enterprise is meant the industrial, commercial and economic activities carried on by the central government or by a state government or jointly by the central government and a state government and in each case either solely so long as it is managed by a self-governed management. From the definition,

one can depict that the notable characteristics of a public enterprise include government ownership, government control and management, public accountability, constituent of political and administrative structure, public purpose, covering wide areas of activities and autonomous functioning. According to Jagdish Prakash, Rao and Shukla cited in Agabi and Orokpo (2014), public enterprises do differ from private enterprises in many respects such as, service motive, capital intensity and monopoly. Public enterprises are accountable to the public and less flexible unlike their private counterparts. They submitted that public enterprises have to perform the role of model employer. Most times, regulations are set to guide the prices at which public enterprises provide public goods and services. Moreso, public enterprises are expected to produce distinct economic and social services compared to private enterprises that are profit oriented. Owing to huge financial requirements and developmental quest of the government, public enterprises are expected to exploit the natural and technological resources, provide strong industrial base and infrastructural facilities, redirect foreign assistance and reduce regional imbalances. Corroborating the above view, Kenny (2019) noted that the social benefits expected to emanate from public enterprises include protection of the interests of the consumers, generation of employment opportunities, reducing the disparities in income and wealth, stimulation of research and development and provision of employment.

In line with the view above, Okeke, Onuorah and Okonkwo (2016) argued that the term public enterprise is used in the broadest sense to mean all industrial and commercial firms, mines, utilities, transport companies, and financial intermediaries owned and/or controlled wholly or to some extent by government. It implies that public enterprise is any commercial, financial, industrial, agricultural or promotional undertaking, owned by public authority, either wholly or through majority share holding, which is engaged in the sale of goods and services and whose affairs are capable of being recorded in balance sheets and profit and loss accounts. Such undertakings may have diverse legal and corporate forms, such as departmental undertakings, public corporations, statutory agencies established by Acts of Parliament or Joint Stock Companies registered under the company laws. Also, implicit in this definition is an expected economic or social return on investment. Public enterprises by virtue of their establishment are expected to provide goods and services that would influence the socio-economic life of the people. Money invested by public enterprises in production of public goods and services are expected to yield positive returns which depicts profitability. For social oriented enterprises, investments made are expected to manifest its returns on the standard of living of the citizenry. The definition also highlighted other characteristic of a public enterprise that distinguishes it from a government department or a private firm; that is, the degree of public control, a feature that is hard to define. Public enterprises being a brainchild of government unlike private ones receive a greater deal of government control. On the other hand and in comparison with other government departments, public enterprises enjoy a greater deal of administrative autonomy. This is because, they are regulated by either statutory instruments establishing them or the dictates of the corporate affairs commission, that is, company laws. Corroborating this view, Ayebe (2018) rightly asserted that in theory, a public enterprise is less directly controlled by government than a department, given its separate legal character though it is still under larger government control than a private firm. One crucial distinction is that the government appoints the board of directors, the chief executive officer (CEO), or appoints the board or body that then appoints the Chief Executive Officer (CEO). This usually means fifty percent (50%) or greater public ownership. A state enterprise might be a natural monopoly or a competitive manufacturing establishment (Nwali, Nwokeiwu and Oganezi, 2019). It might be operating in a command economy surrounded by other state-owned enterprises, or it may be one of a handful of state firms in a predominantly free market. It was for this reason that the World Bank (2000) cited in Okeke, Onuorah, and Okonkwo (2016) affirmed that public enterprises are government-owned or controlled commercial entities that generate all or most of their revenues from the sale of goods and services.

In a more legal oriented perspective, Ojeifo and Alegbeleye (2017) averred that public enterprises are those institutions established through separate Acts of parliament. Hence, they are also regarded as statutory corporations. The functions and powers of the corporations are clearly defined in the Acts through which they are established. They are a corporate body specially created by a legislative enactment with clearly defined powers and functions with considerable financial and administrative autonomy. Instances of public enterprises at the state level include; Ebonyi State Water Corporation, Ebonyi State Newspaper Publishing Corporation, Ebonyi Hotels and Suites, Ebonyi State Pipeline Production Ltd; Ebonyi State Rural Electrification Board; Ebonyi State Investment and Development Company Ltd; Ebonyi State Fertilizer Plant, Ebonyi State Housing Development Corporation; Ebonyi State Broadcasting Corporation among others. At the national level, some of the public enterprises include; Nigeria National Petroleum Corporation (NNPC), Nigeria Rural Electrification Agency, Nigeria Ports Authority, National Television Authority, Federal Radio Corporation of Nigeria, Bank of Industry, Central Bank of Nigeria, Small and Medium Enterprises Development Agency, Nigeria Deposit Insurance Corporation. Furthermore, Ogohi, D. (2014) opined that in practice, countries vary widely in what they choose to operate as state enterprises. The telephone system is a public corporation in Jamaica, for example and a department in Mauritius and Bangladesh. The Indian Railways, India's largest commercial organization-indeed one of the largest in the world is a government department that functions with more autonomy than many state-owned enterprises. This situation illustrates the problem of finding a precise definition for state enterprises.

From the foregoing conceptualisations, one can rightly assert that public enterprise combines the features of public administration with the key attributes of private enterprise. The creation of these enterprises results from the desire to infuse more flexibility and efficiency in the operation of some state activities. It must be emphasized here that while the civil service exists by civil service rules, government enterprises are created by separate laws. This is why Ademolekun (2000) in Anyadike, (2013) rightly stated that a public enterprise is an organization that is set up as a corporate body and as part of the governmental apparatus for an entrepreneurial or entrepreneurial-like objective. Public enterprise stands as an important part of the government structure, with annual budgets, critical investment plans, high level personnel structure, financial auditing and day to day matters all under the strict regulation and supervision of relevant government organs and processes.

Economic Development

Economic development like most social science concepts defies a common perspective. However, opinion of most scholars have it that economic development involves the allocation of limited resources-land, labour, capital and entrepreneur in a way that has a positive effect on the level of business activity, employment, income distribution patterns, and fiscal solvency (Igwe, 2011 cited in Ede, 2016). Understandable from the view above is that economic development is the expansion of capacities that contribute to the advancement of society through the realization of individual, firm and community potential. Economic development is measured by a sustained increase in prosperity and quality of life through innovation, lowered transaction costs, and the utilization of capabilities towards the responsible production and diffusion of goods and services. Economic development requires effective institutions grounded in norms of openness, tolerance for risk, appreciation for diversity, and confidence in the realization of mutual gain for the public and the private sector. Economic Development is essential to creating the conditions for economic growth and ensuring economic future. Similarly, Okolocha, John-Akamelu, and Muogbo (2020) conceptualized economic development as the increase in the amount of people in a nation's population with sustained growth from a simple low income economy to modern higher income economy; its scope includes the process and policies by which a nation improves the economic, political and social well being of its people. Implicit in the view

above is that economic development connotes social and technological progress, improvement in variety of indicators such as literacy rates, life expectancy and poverty rates.

Furthermore, Ede (2016) rightly argued that countries are categorized as “first world (developed)” or “third world (underdeveloped or developing)” based on the criterion of economic development. Thus, United States of America (USA) is said to be the largest economy in the world (the most developed) while African, Latin American continents and some Asian countries aside the like of China, Singapore, Japan among others are derogatorily referred to as third world just because of their level of economic development. Therefore, economic development is very crucial for countries’ national and international affairs and status. It affects its domestic and foreign policy positions, psychological and attitudinal dispositions of the population amongst others.

From the foregoing analysis, it is deducible that economic development is a multi-dimensional process of qualitative and quantitative transformation of the system of production, exchange, distribution and consumption of goods and services to foster increased standard of living, higher per capita income, improved national income, increased gross domestic product and full employment in a country. In a developed economy, poverty, hunger and unemployment rate are relatively low; there is high rate of consumption, mechanized agriculture, change in technological advancements, improved health conditions and high life expectancy rate. In a developed economy, poverty, hunger, suffering, illiteracy and ignorance are at their lowest ebbs. Economic development would be said to be in place if and only if there is provision of basic life sustaining goods, food, shelter, health and protection; there is increase in the standard of living through increases in income, provision of jobs, better education and greater attention to cultural and humanistic values to have that sense of worth and self respect – self esteem; there is freedom of individuals and nations from servitude and dependence; there is the ability to expand the range of economic and social choices available to individuals and nations; there is freedom of individuals from evils of poverty, ignorance, filth, squalor, deprivation and exploitation; there is the creation of employment for all available workforce; there is correction of existing economic, social or political injustices, inequalities and oppression and availability of environment that enables people realize their potential, build self-confidence and lead lives of dignity and fulfilment.

Revenue Generation

Revenue generation has been defined in various ways by scholars and managers alike. One of the commonest views of the concept is that revenue entails the monetary value of all sales of goods and services received by an organisation in a given period (Chigudu, 2015). The implication of the above definition is that revenue represents the value of goods and services (in monetary terms) received by an organisation over a period of time. Furthermore, Aja-Okorie (2016) defined revenue as the fund required by the government and institutions to finance its activities. The idea above is of interest in the context of this study as it sees revenue from the public perspective although revenue is of essence in private sector as well. It was for the reason above that credence is laid to the view of Onodugo, Onodugo, Amujiri, Asogwa, and Anyadike (2015) who conceived revenue generation as the total amount of income that accrues to an organization (public or private) within a specified period of time. In their view, government revenue comprises of receipt from taxation as well as realizations from the sale of government property, interests, returns from loans, investment earnings and proceeds of state-owned ventures. It was in view of the above that Ibrahim, and Ozioma, (2019) conceptualised revenue as the income received from normal business operations and other business activities. The definition though concise, is significant because it captured the source of income called revenue. In general usage, revenue is income received by an organization in the form of cash or cash equivalents from services rendered.

With the meaning of revenue provided, it therefore suggests that revenue generation entails the process of making income by an organisation from its operation. Credence to the above view was laid by Mbah,

and Onuora, (2018) who asserted that revenue generation refers to the process by which an organisation both public and private makes income from delivery of goods or services to the consumers. The definition above entails therefore that generating revenue involves receiving an income in exchange for delivering a product or providing a service. The implication is that revenue generation is one of the primary objectives of any business-like venture including public enterprises.

Revenue generation has been considered as a major factor of success in the 21st-century economy. Stavros (2021) observed that the higher the revenue of the government is, the more convenient it will be to mobilize capital for development activities and additional spending on such development process. Governments at different levels including Ebonyi State have the responsibility of mobilizing revenue in order to meet the needs of the citizenry in terms of providing public goods and services as well as investing in infrastructural development projects like water, electricity, roads, public housing, and transport facilities among others (Molander, Felleson, and Friman, 2018). Ebonyi State government has enormous development gaps to fill, and weak revenue mobilization is the root cause of fiscal imbalances that the state experiences. Moreover, most states in Nigeria especially Ebonyi State have had serious issues regarding residents' level of tax compliance. Citizens hardly pay taxes owing to low per capita income. This usually leads the state government to undue dependence on statutory allocations from the federation account which on its own appear to be among the list among comity of states' revenue share in Nigeria. For this reason, one can align with Popoola, Asaleye, and Eluyela (2018), who observed that in order to accomplish economic development goals, revenues ought to be substantial. For public enterprises, it mainly comes from sales revenue which is income received from selling public goods or services over a period of time.

Job Creation

Job creation as a concept is not new in the field of social and management sciences. As such, the concept has been variously defined by scholars from various fields of study. For instance, Okolocha, John-Akamelu, and Muogbo, (2020) defined job creation as the process of providing new jobs, especially for people who are unemployed. One salient feature of the definition above is that it described job creation as an act of providing new jobs. By implication, job creation has to do with creating additional jobs for people especially the unemployed ones. It is therefore, a process by which the number of jobs in an organization, state, or nation is increased. However, a more comprehensive definition was offered by Umar (2011) cited in Ayeni, Sani, Andeshi, Ibrahim, and Adamu (2021) who defined job creation as "the process of providing new jobs for unemployed people, the process of providing higher self-employment opportunities and the process of providing more paid jobs" (p.2). The above description of job creation is all encompassing as it did not limit job creation to paid employment alone. He rightly pointed out that job creation is the act of providing jobs for the unemployed, either by helping them to create jobs for themselves or providing a paid job where they can get salaries or wages as the case may be. The above definition given by Umar however failed to capture under-employed people in the category hence the search for a more comprehensive definition of what job creation should mean continues. For this reason, concord is made to the view of Ayeni et al (2021) who defined job creation as the net new job that is created without displacing any other economic activity. What can be deduced from the above definition is that job creation is the process of creating new jobs without necessarily creating unemployment in other sectors as a result of the jobs that have so far been created. The above definition is close to and also includes what job creation should mean, never the less it failed to include the category of people who are underemployed to seek a better one. Flowing from the above definitions, and for this study, job creation can be defined as the process of creating new jobs for the unemployed and the under-employed without necessarily displacing people who are already employed in other economic activities.

Another dimension of job creation role of public enterprises is skill development for paid or self-employment. Skill refers to "the knowledge, expertise, competencies and other attributes embodied in

an individual or group of individuals acquired during their life time and used to produce goods or services and necessary for paid or self-employment. Skill development is the most pragmatic effort towards human capital development for economic development (Ukoha et al 2014). Furthermore, Amadi and Alolote (2019) asserted that human capital measures the skills, education capacity and attributes of labour which influence their productive capacity and earning potential. Human capital represents the human factor, the combined intelligence, skills and expertise that give an organization its distinctive character. The human elements of the organization are those that are capable of learning, changing, innovating and providing the creative thrust which if properly motivated can ensure the long term economic growth (Okolocha et al 2020). Also, Nnaeto and Ndoh (2020) described skill development as empowerment of people, and enabling them to participate actively in their own employment. Job creation can be measured using this index. The quality of manpower available in a country to a large extent determines the general economic growth of that country. A country with high level of illiteracy cannot be productive and efficient in management of both private and public sectors enterprises.

Skill development according to Agashi (2021) involves efforts aimed at ensuring that people acquire varieties of technical, vocational and business skills needed for self improvement, self-employment or paid employment for overall economic development of any nation. He further argues that, vocational skills typically refer to skills and occupations gained towards becoming knowledgeable in a specific trade or profession. Examples of vocational skills include; panel-beating; carpentry and joinery; furniture-making; plumbing; and pipe fitting; brick-laying and concreting; electrical installations; radio and television repair; computer programming; GSM maintenance; welding and fabrication; forging and casting; plumbing; aluminium works; machining; and photography/video. These could be achieved through vocational training (Agashi, 2021).

On the other hand, technical skills refer to the specialized knowledge and expertise needed to accomplish complex actions, tasks, and processes relating to computational and physical technology as well as diverse operations of enterprises. Those who possess technical skills are often referred to as "technicians", with the expression referring to audio technicians, electronics technicians, market technicians, computer technicians, engineering technicians, and a variety of other designations (Okolocha et al 2020). Technical skills usually refer to ability to perform tasks that require the use of certain tools, whether tangible or intangible, and the technology required to master their intended uses in a variety of scenarios. In this regard, the knowledge in a technical skills capacity is seen as practical in nature because it allows an individual to complete a designated task in a real world, not theoretical, manner. Given the growth of technology within worldwide and local economies, the need for diverse technical skills and knowledge is likely to continue to grow into the foreseeable future. The acquisition of advanced technical skills requires specialized education or training, often with hands-on learning components. Technical skill requirements are listed for the majority of career fields, with the highest concentrations being employment in areas involving scientific, technological, engineering, computational, and mathematical capabilities. In finance for instance, technical skills consist of an array of knowledge areas that include computing abilities, quantitative analysis, and various financial market forecasting techniques. Technical analysis requires a variety of mathematical skills, often advanced in nature, to produce price chart analysis and model trends that look at historical information to predict future price movements. Technical skills in this context usually refer to an individual who possesses the knowledge and expertise to complete the mathematical tasks required to gather the historical data, produce a data model set and perform directional analysis on the various outputs. Provision of opportunities for people to acquire these skills by government is an effort towards job creation.

From the foregoing, job creation therefore refers to process by which employment opportunities are provided for the unemployed by way of direct employment or self-employment. It is provision of job

opportunities for all who is willing, ready and able to work at any given point in time in a position that matches his or her capabilities, knowledge and skills.

Standard of Living

Standard of living as a concept has amassed varieties of definitions by scholars. It has become a critical issue in developing economies especially in the light of the outbreak of Covid-19 pandemic which has altered socio-economic structures. One of the notable indices for measuring economic development in any nation is standard of living of the people. Standard of living entails the level of material comfort or quality of life enjoyed by an individual (Sallah, 2020). He argued further that standard of living is commonly regarded as the level of availability and accessibility of basic amenities such as pipe-borne water, food, basic health services, basic education, shelter, roads and electricity amongst others to an individual. Standard of living is relevant because it is considered to contribute to an individual's quality of life. It entails availability of quality and affordable housing, access to and quality of healthcare, quality and availability of education, literacy rates, life expectancy, occurrence of diseases, cost of goods and services, and access to quality and affordable public transportation. People have certain basic needs without which life would be impossible or difficult. These life-sustaining basic human needs include; food, shelter, health and protection. When any or all of these is absent or critically in short supply, poor standard of living is said to abound. A basic function of all economic activities, therefore, is to provide as many people as possible with the means of overcoming helplessness and misery arising from lack of food, shelter, and clothing among others. To this extent, one may assert that development is a necessary condition for the improvement of the quality of life. Without sustained and continuous economic progress at the individual as well as the societal level, realization of the human potential would not be possible. Raising per capita incomes, elimination of absolute poverty, and lessening income inequalities therefore constitute necessary conditions for improved standard of living.

Furthermore, standard of living could be thought of as a measure of the quality of life or level of material prosperity enjoyed by individuals, a specific demographic group, or a geographic region such as a country. In economics, standard of living is usually applied to determine the relative prosperity of the population of a country and is often compared to the standard of living that populations of other countries enjoy. Abah, Nkwede, and Nwuzor, (2017) asserted that factors that determine the standard of living include access to basic necessities of life such as food, water, electricity, level of income, physical health, quality of the environment, housing availability, life expectancy, personal safety, access to education, medical facilities, and social services. For instance, food is the most basic need of man and any country that cannot produce enough food for its population is in serious trouble. A developed country is supposed to be self-sufficient in food production because before you do other things, you must feed well. Good food also enhances the physical and mental development of man, making him disposed to work and create wealth.

Economists often use per capita income as a measure of standard of living. Per capita income is simply the average amount of money earned per person in the country. Per capita income counts each man, woman, and child, even newborn babies, as a member of the population and divides the total value of goods and services produced in the country, state, region or area within a given period by the total population (Sallah, 2020). The result of the above mathematical computation shows the standard of living which on its own shows the level of material comfort, or quality of life, enjoyed by an individual or group. Generally speaking, a higher per capita income allows people to buy more goods and services, increases access to education, and increases access to healthcare, all of which increases quality of life and thus life expectancy. Higher per capita income also means that a country has a higher tax base to support social services, infrastructure, public education, and other investments that can further improve the population's standard of living. On the contrary, using per capita income to measure a country's standard of living can be misleading. For one, per capita income does not account for increases in the

cost of living (the cost of basic necessities, such as food, clothing, and housing). If a nation's average cost of living increases at a higher rate than its per capita income, then standards of living might in fact be declining because people are spending more to live but not earning enough money to cover these increases. Furthermore, per capita income measurements neglect questions of how income is distributed among a country's citizens. In some instances a nation's per capita income rises because the income of the wealthiest segment of the population has grown at an extremely high rate, while the income of the poorest segment has remained stagnant. In other words, a nation with an increased per capita income may have also reached a higher overall standard of living, but the total number of individuals enjoying an acceptable standard of living may have actually declined. At the same time, determining standards of living according to per capita income, or any other economic measurement, unavoidably ignores other aspects of material comfort that are not determined by economic forces, such as environmental quality. These factors are controlled by government policy rather than the economy, and so they are not reflected in a nation's per capita income. From the foregoing, standard of living is closely associated with quality of life.

Therefore, it is deducible from the foregoing that standard of living refers to the extent to which individuals have access to basic necessities of life such as food, shelter, clothing, water, electricity, primary healthcare, basic education and accessible road network among others. It defines the quality of life of the individual and the society at large which invariably determines the level of economic development obtainable in such society. Developed nations like America, United Kingdom, France, Germany, and Canada among others have higher standard of living and therefore adjudged economically developed societies unlike African societies where there is poor standard of living.

Role of Public Enterprises in improving Standard of Living in Ebonyi State

It is an indubitable fact that public enterprises were established to accelerate better standard of living of the people in Nigeria particularly in Ebonyi State. One of the roles of public enterprises is to produce quality goods and services consumable by the citizens especially the less privileged group in order to improve their standard of living. It is the role of public enterprises to ensure availability and accessibility of these goods and services in order to increase the gross domestic product (GDP) (Kenny, 2019). The implication of higher standard of living is higher per capita income. A higher per capita income generally amounts to increase in the amount of goods consumers can purchase, increases in access to quality health care, and increases in life expectancy, all of which are important factors in determining an individual's standard of living.

Furthermore, public enterprises in Ebonyi State have enormous role to play in improving the standard of living of the people. This because, government has established them in almost all facets of human life to render a given public goods and/or services aimed at improving the standard of living in the state. In the area of education, government has established numerous universities, polytechnics, colleges of educations, institutes, technical and vocational centres, secondary schools, primary schools and the likes across the country. These institutions render educational services to ensure accessibility to basic education and improve the lots of the people. Also, in the case of healthcare services, government at the national level has established various federal medical centres, federal teaching hospitals, primary health care centres, and the likes. At the state level, government established state hospitals, primary healthcare centres, and the likes. This also necessitated the establishment of Ebonyi State Community and Social Development Agency to provide community development services to improve the lots of rural communities in the state. The same goes to the local government level which provides local healthcare services especially maternity centres.

In the transportation sector, there is the Ebonyi State Transport Corporation (EBOTRANS) which renders transport services within and across the state. The transport corporation was aimed at ensuring accessibility to transport services by the people of Ebonyi State for journeys both within and outside

the state. Similar enterprises exist in other states of the federation such as the Enugu State Transport Corporation (ENTRACO) in Enugu State, the Onitsha South Mass Transit Ltd in Anambra State, the Imo State Transport Corporation in Imo State, Benue Links in Benue State and a host of others. These state-owned enterprises contribute their quota to the growth of the GDP, per capita income and standard of living in Nigeria. In a bid to ensure accessibility to quality water supply, government established state water corporations. In Ebonyi State, the Ebonyi Water Corporation was established to provide portable water supply to the people of the state.

More so, one of the rationales for governmental intervention in the provision and management of goods and services is the fact that no person should be permanently denied access to such facilities because of lack of finance or by reason of geographical location. In this manner, public enterprises try to reduce inequality and promote equitable distribution of income in the society. Establishment of public enterprise by the state enables it to pursue objective relating to social equity which the market would ignore notably among which is preventing the concentration of wealth or the means of production and exchange. Equitable distribution of resources does not mean that everybody must be equal but that the basic necessities for social survival are provided for everybody at all levels of the social strata.

Notwithstanding, it has been argued by scholars that public enterprises have not played desired role in improving the standard of living of the people. Presenting his argument, Ayebe (2018) wrote that from the stand point of quality of service rendered, it is the opinion of many researchers that public enterprises have failed woefully in delivery of quality public goods and services to improve the living conditions of people in Nigeria. The argument is that generally, most public enterprises in Ebonyi State render unsatisfactory goods and services to the people. In view of the above, Khan cited in Agabi and Orokpo (2014) lamented that the dismal performance of state-owned enterprises both in financial and service output has been the subject matter of considerable criticism, discussion and controversy as they appear to have imposed heavy burden on government revenue yet, failing to fulfil the role they were set up to play. Government-owned enterprises like the Ebonyi Water Corporation for example, appear notoriously ineffective in meeting demand for portable water supply as well as diversifying operations and creating jobs that would help alleviate poverty and raise people's standards of living especially in Abakaliki Metropolis. Evidences abound in the lack of basic necessities, high rate of unemployment, poverty, inequality, life expectancy among others in the capital city of Abakaliki.

Furthermore, Ogohi, (2014) argued that despite the great expectations that spurred the establishment of public enterprises and the huge investments and subventions pumped in to float and maintain them, they seem to have remained a colossal drain on the nation's hard earned resources with little or no positive impact on the socio-economic life of the citizenry. The implication of the above assertion is that the actual performance of public enterprises in Nigeria including Ebonyi State leaves much to be desired. It appears that many of them are not responding to the changing economic realities. They appear not to possess knowledge and strategies for translating into reality the hope of viable public sector. Lamenting on the performance of public enterprises in Nigeria, Ogohi (2014) expressed dismay as follows:

The dismal performance of state-owned enterprises has given the government some cause of anxiety...the spate of public opinion in the last few years provides available evidence that these enterprises have failed to fulfil their mandates (p.14).

A take-away from the above submission by Ogohi is that public enterprises in Nigeria particularly in Ebonyi State seem to have failed woefully in every sense of it. Instance is the case of Ebonyi Hotels Ltd that seems like a skeleton of itself at the moment. Government owned transportation lines like Ebonyi State Transport Corporation seem to be winding up while those of the private individuals like Peace Mass Transit Ltd tend to flourish. Hence, it has been a piece in the mind of every Nigerian that

state-owned enterprises have failed in their objectives. Year in year out, these enterprises especially in Ebonyi State seem to record huge inefficiencies, epileptic service delivery, poor patronage by citizens, deficit balance on return on investment and redundant personnel.

In summary, the poor performance of public enterprise in Nigeria was well captured by the Nigerian Bureau of Public Enterprises cited in Kenny (2019) where it was argued that there is virtually no public enterprise in Nigeria today that functions well. While they were created to alleviate the shortcomings of the private sector and spearhead the development of Nigeria, many of them have stifled entrepreneurial development and fostered economic stagnation. Nigeria Telecommunication, the defunct Power Holding Company of Nigeria and the Nigeria National petroleum Corporation (NNPC) are examples of these. Currently, it was reported that the Nigeria National Petroleum Corporation plans to borrow \$2.7bn from commercial banks to buy 20% equity at Dangote Refinery, a privately-owned refinery that is yet to commence operation (Vanguard Newspaper, June, 2021). The implication is that the corporation for its numerous years in existence has not been able to build at least a standard refinery to serve its objective. Hence, public enterprises have served as platforms for patronage and the promotion of political objectives, and consequently suffer from operational interference political appointees. Therefore, whenever there is an increase in standard of living, citizens in the economy increase demand for social goods and services. To serve this end, public enterprises have a role to play in the provision of these goods and services to complement the efforts the private sector.

Role of Public Enterprises in Promoting Job Creation in Ebonyi State

State ownership of some enterprise is seen as a means of employment creation in a situation where the private sector of the economy offers very limited employment opportunities. Unemployment situation in Ebonyi State has become alarming over the years and one of the worst across Nigeria.

Public enterprises ought to create jobs to reduce the unemployment problem in Ebonyi State. This is because; the role of job creation in enhancing economic development cannot be underestimated. This informed why some countries of the world strive to create viable government-owned businesses to support job creation. Developing countries like Nigeria have put up several social investment programmes that were believed to be geared towards job creation for achievement of full employment objective (Udu and Onwe, 2016). The difference between a developed country and developing country seems to be the capacity of the former to enhance job creation for the greatest number of her citizens, while the latter cannot enhance job creation because of the absence of viable public enterprises. Ayeni, et al (2021) asserted that job creation for some countries result to full employment owing to some viable state-owned ventures that provide job opportunities, while job creation suffers in other countries that lack viable government-owned business hence, a greatest numbers of their citizens are unemployed. Indeed, one of the rationales behind public enterprises establishment has been the creation of more jobs for people in Ebonyi State. For instance, Abuh, Acho and Peter (2016) noted that the performance of public sector is to be judged in the light of total support it rendered job creation to bring about the desired change in the economic order of the society. Since the guiding principle of social investment is to create and enhance social benefits in terms of employment and income, the quantum of employment created by the public sector should be taken note of.

One of the approaches state-owned enterprises have adopted in job creation is development of vocational and technical skills among the people. Efe-Imafidon Ade-Adeniji, Umukoro, and Ajitemisan (2018) posited that skill development has been a strategy of government to enable the unemployed especially the youth to learn knowledge and skills that help them to plan, start and run their own entrepreneurial ventures and has been acknowledged to contribute to social and economic development of both the individual and the society. Many scholars explicitly connect investment in human capital development to economic development, productivity, growth, and innovation. This has frequently been cited as a justification for government subsidies for empowerment and job skills training. Ebonyi State

government in attempt at improving entrepreneurial skill acquisition has over the years established and maintained numerous vocational skills acquisition centres across the state including establishment of Ebonyi State Community and Social Development Agency. Skill acquisition is an investment that makes individuals genuinely more productive. Individuals who are more productive will also have higher earnings and be more employable. As such, public enterprises' role at human capital development involves empowerment of the people to acquire relevant knowledge, talents, skills, abilities, experience, intelligence, training, judgment, and wisdom for employment and entrepreneurship.

One of the approaches governments have adopted in promoting employment generation is skill development through establishment of vocational skills acquisition centres. In the opinion of Abah, Nkwede, and Nwuzor, (2017), in realisation of the fact that a sustained effort in job creation requires government's promotion of skill acquisition in Ebonyi State necessitated the state government into the establishment of Ebonyi State Community Development Agency, EBSCDA. The Agency since establishment has embarked on provision of facilities for skill acquisition centres, primary and secondary schools as well as provision of basic amenities in the rural areas. It was for this reason that Ezeali, Uwadi and Nwaowu, (2019) observed that the Agency's intervention in the area of schools, provision of classroom blocks, laboratories, civic centres, vocational training centres have been aimed at enhanced skill acquisition for the teeming unemployed youths. Most youths upon graduation from these vocational institutions are better equipped with necessary skills for self-reliance through entrepreneurial ventures. Some have leveraged on the skills acquired to obtain employment in construction companies and private sector organisations in the state (Ezeali, Uwadi and Nwaowu, 2019). As such, there is no doubt that public enterprises in Ebonyi State have enormous roles to play in job creation to guarantee full employment in the state.

However, despite the existence of public enterprises, unemployment continues to be a source of concern in Nigeria particularly in Ebonyi State. This, it has been argued, is as a result of an increase in population as well as a challenging economic environment in the state. Employment and Job creation was the most talked about issue during the recently concluded general elections in the country. In Nigeria, this issue is compounded by the expanding number of students/ candidates gaining admission into tertiary institutions in recent years. In turn, this has led to a large turnout of graduates without the corresponding number of available jobs. The fact that these new graduates are competing for relatively fewer jobs in the formal sector (together with the accumulated pool of unemployed over previous administrations) has compounded the problem. To address this challenge, each administration has come up with its own policy to curtail the challenge. The results have varied over the years with recorded cases of little progress. As with previous governments, the new administration has employment generation as one of its focal areas.

Role of Public Enterprises in Promoting Revenue Generation in Ebonyi State

Government cannot function without adequate internal revenue base. Such internally generated revenue is re-invested in other economic development objectives such as infrastructural facilities. One of the reasons for government establishing public enterprises in Ebonyi State just like any other state in Nigeria is the need to ensure government control over key profitable ventures in the economy such as central banking, broadcasting, iron and steel international air transport, shipping among others for generation of internal revenue. Government establishes commercial oriented enterprises to generate revenue for the development of infrastructure through these sectors.

The objective of government setting up state-owned enterprises to run in a business-like manner is indubitably to make them more efficient in revenue generation to at least cover their cost of operation and then, remit surplus to government coffers to further develop infrastructural facilities for overall economic development. Kenny, (2019) supported this opinion when he asserted that public enterprises

seek to generate revenue and mobilize surplus for reinvestment in other economic development activities. According to him, the essence of these enterprises earning money is to mobilize public savings for industrial development. The profits earned by public enterprises ought to be reinvested for expansion and diversification. State-owned financial institutions like central bank, micro finance banks, bank of industry, mortgage banks among others mobilize scattered public savings thereby helping the process of capital formation in the country.

In the words of Ibrahim and Ozioma (2019), the fact that all the tiers of government needs revenue to finance their activities entails that they must find ways of obtaining revenue to offset their expenditure. They argued further that some of the sources of finance available to the government include taxes, royalties, levies fines, penalties, loans, grants, donations, lands, buildings and other assets, profits or surpluses made by public enterprises, dividends paid to government on shares owned in companies, interest received on loans made by the governments, rents received on government owned properties, and income from the sale of government services inter alia. Looking at the above, most significant in the context of this study is the surpluses made by public enterprises from the goods and services they render.

In most countries with an abundant supply of resources like Nigeria, the state usually owns a stake in minerals, oil, and gas produced locally. The resources are accrued because a state owned enterprise owns or operates shares through what is known as an operating license. The license allows a state-owned enterprise to enter into a production-sharing contract with other entities on behalf of the government and generate revenue. In addition, revenue can be generated when entities with which a state-owned enterprise is transacting make payments through royalties rather than actual currencies. Apart from representing the government in commercial activities, a state owned enterprise also sells physical resources, mostly to trading bodies and companies. In many countries, the management of state resources such as oil and gas is a preserve of state-owned enterprise, because it provides an avenue through which the government can be held accountable on matters involving extractive resources.

As earlier noted, revenue generation by public enterprises accrue from trading surpluses, taxes and dividends, and earnings from sales of goods and services after deduction of employed capital. In most countries like Nigeria with an abundant supply of resources, the government usually owns a stake in minerals, oil, and gas produced locally. In this case, state-owned enterprise owns or operates shares through what is known as an operating license. According to Anthony-Uko, (2018), the license allows a state-owned enterprise to enter into production of contract with other entities in order to generate revenue. Anthony-Uko (2018) further maintained that apart from representing the government in commercial activities, a state-owned enterprise also sells goods and services, mostly to individuals, commercial entities and agencies. Mbah and Onuora (2018) maintained that in many countries such as Nigeria, the management of state resources such as oil and gas is a preserve of state-owned enterprises such as Nigerian National Petroleum Corporation (NNPC). For instance, in 2018, it was revealed that some public enterprises failed to remit not less than N2.74 trillion operating surpluses to government coffers (Anthony-Uko, 2018). She further reported that among top defaulting agencies were the Petroleum Products Pricing Regulatory Agency (PPPRA) and Central Bank of Bank (CBN) which failed to remit operating surpluses of N1.34 trillion and N801 billion as at August 31, 2018, totalling N2.14 trillion. Other agencies mentioned included the Nigeria Ports Authority which failed to remit N192 billion; NIMASA which failed to remit N66 billion; Federal Airport Authority of Nigeria (FAAN) which failed to remit N51.99 billion; Nigeria Postal Agency which failed to remit N37.7 billion and Nigeria Communications Commission (NCC) which failed to remit N30.85 billion; among others (Anthony-Uko, 2018).

In a Vanguard News report by Adesulu (2018), it was reported that in 2011/2012, a JAMB form was bought at the rate of N4,600 by 1,503,931 candidates which amounted to N6,918, 082,600. In 2013, the forms were bought by 1,735,892 candidates at the rate of N4,600, amounting to N7,985,103,200. In

2014, 1,606,753 candidates bought the form at the rate of N4,600, giving JAMB a whopping sum of N7,391,063,800. Furthermore, in 2015, 1,475,477 bought the forms at the rate of N4,500, amounting to N6,558,646,500 revenue. In 2016, the number of candidates rose to 1,589,175, just as a form was sold at the rate of N5,500, bringing the total amount to N8,740,462,500. In 2017, the number of candidates rose to 1,736,571, as form was sold at 5,000, which amounted to N8,682,855,000 revenue. Similarly, Adedigba (2020) reported in Premium Times Newspaper that in 2018, the board remitted N7.8 billion to the federal government, in 2019, JAMB remitted N5 billion to the federal government's purse after the conduct of its 2019 Unified Tertiary Matriculation Examination (UTME). Thus, in period of eight years, JAMB had generated N58,284,213,600 from the sales of forms to prospective candidates into government treasury. This is just a glimpse into the revenue generation role of public enterprises in Nigeria. At the state level, public corporations such as Ebonyi State Water Corporation, Ebonyi State Fertilizer Plant, Ebonyi State Pipeline Productions Ltd, Ebonyi State Properties and Investment Company Limited are supposed to generate revenue from the sale of their products and services thereby promoting the internal revenue base of the state government for investment in other economic development projects and programmes. However, the extent to which these enterprises have performed this role remains unclear.

Notwithstanding, scholars are of the view that public enterprises have not played adequate role in revenue generation in Nigeria including Ebonyi State. Anyebe (2018) for instance wrote that from the stand point of return on investments, public enterprises have been adjudged conduit pipes for draining government's resources. Yearly, net returns on investment by most state-owned enterprises stand at zero or negative threshold whereas output in social service provision remains invisible. It was for this pitiable performance that Anyebe (2018) lamented that from the stand-point of return on investment; there is sufficient evidence that in the main, state-owned enterprises have proved a huge failure in comparison with results from similar investments in the private sector. One thus finds scattered across the country, the skeletons of defunct or moribund state-owned enterprises whose birth-days were marked with fun-fare several years past. This dismal performance reflects public enterprises failure to meet public (customers') aspirations in terms of the quantum of output as well as the quality of services, generation of any reasonable rates of return on investment, capital expenditure and the provision of adequate and reliable services. Furthermore, credence is laid to a public address by former president of Nigeria, Chief Olusegun Obasanjo in 1999 who lamented that on the issue of returns on investment, it is estimated that successive Nigerian governments have invested billions of naira in public owned enterprises with nothing to show for it (Kenobi, 2015). He furthered that annual returns on this huge investment have been well below 10 percent. These inefficiencies and in many cases, huge losses, are charged against the public treasury. In a similar claim, the former Director General, Bureau of Public Enterprises (BPE), Nasir Ahmed El-Rufai claimed that public enterprises consumed over one third of all money made from the sale of oil in Nigeria (Agabi and Orokpo, 2014). However, the extent to which state-owned enterprises in Ebonyi State have performed their role in revenue generation has remained unclear thereby reinforcing the need for the study.

Theoretical Framework

This study was rooted on the New Public Management Theory propounded in 1991 by Hood Christopher; a UK scholar (Charbonneau, 2012). The New Public Management Theory advocates that government should restructure their bureaucracies in order to better provide services to the citizens. This proposes a combination of modern ideas and practices that seek, at its core, the use of private sector and business approaches in the Public Sector. New Public Management seeks to apply market principles to governmental administration, with an emphasis on competition and customer orientation. As submitted by Ibietan (2013), New Public Management Theory emphasizes management by objectives, merit-based recruitment and promotion; increased autonomy for managers ("letting managers manage")

with corresponding responsibility; performances related pay; continuous skills development and upgrading. In a similar vein, Andrews and Steven (2013) argued that there is also an emphasis on performance measurement, with particular attention on the delivery of services to the public.

In New Public Management, citizens are viewed as "customers" and public servants are viewed as public managers. Under New Public Management, public managers have incentive-based motivation such as pay-for-performance, and clear performance targets are often set, which are assessed by using performance evaluations. As well, managers in a New Public Management may have greater discretion and freedom as to how they go about achieving the goals set for them. This New Public Management approach is contrasted with the traditional public administration model, in which institutional decision-making, policy-making and public service delivery is guided by regulations, legislation and administrative bureaucratic bottlenecks. Public Managers under the New Public Management reforms can provide a range of choices from which customers can choose just like their private sector counterparts.

The relevance of this theory to the study cannot be overemphasised owing to the desirability of a reform initiative such as market orientation in management of public enterprises in Nigeria where the quality of public service delivery is perceived as abysmally low. The theory underscores the imperative to make the public enterprises more "businesslike" and to improve its efficiency by using private sector management models. As it is with the private sector which focuses on "customer service", New Public Management practices such as market orientation focuses on the centrality of citizens who are the recipients of the services or customers to the public sector. Its introduction would offer a recipe for treating citizens as "Kings" in the delivery of public or social goods/services. Additionally, the enthronement and enforcement of public accountability will in no small measure provide reduce corruption in the management of state-owned enterprises. Furthermore, the theory underscores that market considerations offer the optimal mechanism for service delivery and decision making by public enterprises. This is because; focus on socio-political considerations produce the tendency of political office holders to conceal the true economic and fiscal positions of the country from the citizens in attempting to keep electioneering promises through deficit financing. As such, the existing public service orientations in the management of public enterprises are poor predictors of citizens' preferences and demands (Ezeani, 2004 cited in Ibietan, 2013). It ignores citizens' preferences and leads to oversupply of low quality and irrelevant services. This state of affairs calls for more efficacious remedy which could be found in the adoption of market orientation in management of state-owned enterprises. Recognizing and understanding current strategies, creating new strategies, selecting preferred strategies, implementing or managing those selected and modifying them are necessary for productivity of state-owned enterprises. Hence, state-owned enterprises seeking higher performance ought to engage in major innovations, finding new resources that produce superior public goods and not equivalent to the competitors for citizens' satisfaction. Market orientation stresses the importance of using information about both customers and competitors in formulating strategy. Ebonyi State Transport Corporation for instance out to gather and use knowledge about products, price and strategies of competitors like Peace Mass Transit Ltd, Romchi Mass Transit Ltd, etc, to offer similar or more conducive and effective transport services to people in Ebonyi State and beyond. A market-oriented state enterprise presumably has established valuable resources in the form of customer loyalty, brand awareness, and expertise within the organisation on how to maintain strong customer relationships that afford it a competitive advantage. Innovation acts as the medium to achieve superior performance through market orientation. The hallmark of this idea is that innovation could strategise public organizations to observe and take up market orientation as one of the important strategies in improving their marketing strategy to achieve superior performance hence higher productivity. It is posited that a strong market-oriented culture enables state-owned enterprises to adapt to the changing business

environment, provides them with a competitive advantage over their competitors and enhance their productivity.

Method

Descriptive survey design was adopted to study 1567 staff of selected enterprises and residents being beneficiaries. The sample size was 319 determined using Taro Yemene's and Kumar's sample allocation formulae. Stratified and judgmental sampling techniques were adopted. Data were collected from primary and secondary sources. The instrument for data collection was structured questionnaire. Data were analysed using statistical tables, mean and standard deviation. This was shown in the table below:

Table 1: Summary of Population of the Study

S/N	Selected State-Owned Enterprises	Population
1.	Ebonyi State Transport Corporation	78
2.	Ebonyi State Broadcasting Corporation	173
3.	Ebonyi State Fertilizer Plant	74
4.	Ebonyi State Newspaper Publishing Corporation	42
5.	Residents	1200
	Total	1567

Source: Personnel Department of each of the selected enterprises (2023).

The choice of these enterprises was informed by their nature as establishments that are more economic oriented, self-financing and operate under a significant level of autonomy. Their performance via the goods and services they render have direct bearing on the various economic development variables such as revenue generation, job creation, standard of living and human capital development being investigated in the study. The inclusion of residents is to ensure that the opinions of the public being the beneficiaries of the services of public enterprises are included to ensure objectivity.

Results

Table 2: Frequency, Percentages, Mean Scores and Standard Deviation of Responses to determine the extent Public Enterprises have enhanced Revenue Generation in Ebonyi State

S/N	ITEM	SA 5	A 4	U 3	D 2	SD 1	N	Mean	SD
1	Public enterprises were established to generate revenue for financing economic development projects and programmes in Ebonyi State	122 (40.4)	103 (34.1)	30 (9.9)	26 (8.6)	21 (7.0)	302 (100%)	3.92	1.23
2	Public enterprises in Ebonyi State generate enough revenue to increase internal revenue earnings of the state government	55 (18.2)	49 (16.2)	55 (18.2)	70 (23.2)	73 (24.2)	302 (100%)	2.84	1.42
3	Public enterprises in Ebonyi state consistently remits surplus revenue for financing infrastructural	58 (19.2)	51 (16.9)	50 (16.6)	74 (24.5)	69 (22.8)	302 (100%)	2.82	1.47

	projects by the state government								
4	Public enterprises in Ebonyi State generate enough revenue capable of diversifying their operations without dependence on the state government for subvention	49 (16.2)	60 (19.9)	57 (18.9)	65 (21.5)	71 (23.5)	302 (100%)	2.84	1.41
5	Revenue made from the sale of goods and services provided by public enterprises are always adequate to cover their costs of operation in Ebonyi State	54 (17.9)	50 (16.6)	48 (15.9)	72 (23.8)	78 (25.8)	302 (100%)	2.80	1.42

Source: Field, Survey, 2023

The table above shows the frequency, mean scores and standard deviation of responses to determine the extent to which public enterprises have enhanced revenue generation in Ebonyi State. The result shows that majority of the respondents were of the opinion that public enterprises have not significantly enhanced revenue generation for economic development in Ebonyi State. In item 1, respondents opined that public enterprises were established to generate revenue for financing economic development projects and programmes in Ebonyi State. From their responses, it was revealed that out of a total of 302 respondents, 122 representing 40 percent strongly agreed, 103 respondents representing 34 percent agreed, 30 respondents representing 10 percent were neutral, and 26 representing 9% disagreed whereas 21 respondents strongly disagreed. Furthermore, the mean score 3.92 was accepted since it was above the decision rule benchmark of 3.0. Moreover, the standard deviation value of 1.23 shows that there is a high degree of similarity in opinion among respondents on the Item 1 concerned. This implied that public enterprises were established to generate revenue for financing economic development projects and programmes in Ebonyi State.

Item 2 contains responses, mean and standard deviation to determine whether Public enterprises in Ebonyi State generate enough revenue to increase internal revenue earnings of the state government. From the responses, it was discovered that out of the 302 respondents, 55 representing 18 percent strongly agreed, 49 respondents representing 16 percent agreed, 55 respondents representing 18 percent were neutral, and 70 representing 23% disagreed whereas 73 respondents representing 24 percent strongly disagreed. Moreover, the mean value of 2.84 showed that the respondents disagreed whereas a standard deviation of 1.42 showed that there was high degree of similarity of opinion among the respondents. This implies that majority of the respondents were of the view that public enterprises in Ebonyi State have not generated enough revenue to increase internal revenue earnings of the state government.

Item 3 sought to ascertain the view of respondents on whether public enterprises in Ebonyi state consistently remits surplus revenue for financing infrastructural projects by the state government. From the responses, it was discovered that out of the 302 respondents, 58 representing 19 percent strongly agreed, 51 respondents representing 17 percent agreed, 50 respondents representing 17 percent were neutral, and 74 representing 25% disagreed whereas 63 respondents representing 23 percent strongly disagreed. Moreover, the mean value of 2.82 showed that the respondents disagreed since the mean did not reach the benchmark of 3.0 whereas a standard deviation of 1.47 showed that there was high degree

of similarity of opinion among the respondents. This implies that majority of the respondents agreed that public enterprises in Ebonyi state do not consistently remit surplus revenue for financing infrastructural projects by the state government.

Item 4 sought to ascertain the view of respondents on whether public enterprises in Ebonyi State generate enough revenue capable of diversifying their operations without dependence on the state government for subvention. From the responses, it was discovered that out of the 302 respondents, 49 representing 16 percent strongly agreed, 60 respondents representing 20 percent agreed, 57 respondents representing 19 percent were neutral, and 65 representing 22% disagreed whereas 71 respondents representing 24 percent strongly disagreed. Moreover, the mean value of 2.84 showed that the respondents disagreed since the mean did not reach the benchmark of 3.0 whereas a standard deviation of 1.41 showed that there was high degree of similarity of opinion among the respondents. This implies that majority of the respondents were of the view that public enterprises in Ebonyi State have not generated enough revenue capable of diversifying their operations without dependence on the state government for subvention.

Item 5 sought to ascertain the view of respondents on whether revenue made from the sale of goods and services provided by public enterprises are always adequate to cover their costs of operation in Ebonyi State. From the responses, it was discovered that out of the 302 respondents, 54 representing 18 percent strongly agreed, 50 respondents representing 17 percent agreed, 65 respondents representing 22 percent were neutral, and 71 representing 24% disagreed whereas 78 respondents representing 26 percent strongly disagreed. Moreover, the mean value of 2.80 showed that the respondents disagreed since the mean did not reach the benchmark of 3.0 whereas a standard deviation of 1.42 showed that there was high degree of similarity of opinion among the respondents. This implies that majority of the respondents agreed that revenue made from the sale of goods and services provided by public enterprises are not always adequate to cover their costs of operation in Ebonyi State.

Moreover, secondary data on the revenue performance of the selected state-owned enterprises compiled from the various audited financial statements of the Ebonyi State Government covering five (5) years period (2016-2020) revealed that the enterprises did not make any significant revenue contribution within the period under review. This was shown in tables 13-17 below:

Table 3: Revenue Performance of the Selected State-Owned Enterprises in 2016

SN	Enterprise	Actual Revenue Budget	Revenue Generated	Actual Expenditure	Performance Remarks
1	Ebonyi State Transport Corporation	5,000,000.14	None Reported	12,517,602.30	Budget Deficit
2	Ebonyi State Fertilizer & Chemical Company	52,500,000.00	None Reported	60,614,419.12	Budget Deficit
3	Ebonyi State Broadcasting Corporation	93,319,830	801,458.16	126,198,412.52	Budget Deficit
4	Ebonyi State Newspaper Publishing Corporation	43,349,700	200,000	28,996,389.70	Budget Deficit

Source: Compiled from the 2016 Audited Financial Statements of Ebonyi State Government, Office of the Auditor-General of Ebonyi State (2023)

The table above shows Ebonyi State Government spent about two hundred an fifty-eight million, (₦258m) on the four SOEs in 2016. Despite this huge financial commitment by the government, the state-owned enterprises studied operated on budget deficit for the year ended 2016. In terms of revenue generation, Ebonyi State Transport Corporation, Ebonyi State Fertilizer & Chemical Company, did not report any internally generated revenue within the period under review. Despite such performance, Ebonyi State Transport Corporation spent ₦12million while Ebonyi State Fertilizer & Chemical Company spent ₦60million. Similarly, Ebonyi State Broadcasting Corporation generated ₦801,458.16 only and spent ₦126million while Ebonyi State Newspaper Publishing Corporation generated ₦200,000 only but spent ₦28 million. This corroborates the result gotten from the field survey showing that majority of the respondents were of the view that public enterprises have not significantly contributed to revenue generation in Ebonyi State.

Table 4: Revenue Performance of the Selected State-Owned Enterprises in 2017

SN	Enterprise	Actual Revenue Budget	Revenue Generated	Actual Expenditure	Performance Remarks
1	Ebonyi State Transport Corporation	10,000,000	None Reported	14,455,983.94	Budget Deficit
2	Ebonyi State Fertilizer & Chemical Company	482,148,929	None Reported	18,318,971	Budget Deficit
3	Ebonyi State Broadcasting Corporation	71,613,190	None Reported	140,973,406	Budget Deficit
4	Ebonyi State Newspaper Publishing Corporation	10,100,000	None Reported	29,213,280.13	Budget Deficit

Source: Compiled from the 2017 Audited Financial Statements of Ebonyi State Government, Office of the Auditor-General of Ebonyi State (2023)

The table above shows Ebonyi State Government spent about two hundred an three million, (₦203m) on the four SOEs in 2017. Despite the huge financial commitment above, the result still shows that the state-owned enterprises studied operated on budget deficit for the year ended 2017. None of the enterprises reported any internal revenue within the year under review. In the midst of the poor performance: Ebonyi State Transport Corporation spent N14million; Ebonyi State Fertilizer & Chemical Company spent N18million; Ebonyi State Broadcasting Corporation spent N140million; while Ebonyi State Newspaper Publishing Corporation spent ₦29 million. This corroborates the result gotten from the field survey showing that majority of the respondents were of the view that public enterprises have not significantly contributed to revenue generation in Ebonyi State

Table 5: Revenue Performance of the Selected State-Owned Enterprises in 2018

SN	Enterprise	Actual Revenue Budget	Revenue Generated	Actual Expenditure	Performance Remarks
1	Ebonyi State Transport Corporation	12,000,000	None Reported	19,209,109.11	Budget Deficit
2	Ebonyi State Fertilizer & Chemical Company	578,578,714.80	15,000	51,928,149.93	Budget Deficit
3	Ebonyi State Broadcasting Corporation	145,935,828	5000	131,718,540.0	Budget Deficit
4	Ebonyi State Newspaper Publishing Corporation	57,120,000	2,500,000	107,231,251	Budget Deficit

Source: Compiled from the 2018 Audited Financial Statements of Ebonyi State Government, Office of the Auditor-General of Ebonyi State (2023)

From the table, it was observed that the state government spent over three hundred and two million (₦302m) in the year ended 2018. It can be observed also from the table that Ebonyi State Transport Corporation did not make any revenue contribution to the state government in 2018. On the other hand, Ebonyi State Fertilizer & Chemical Company reported N15000 revenue and spent N19million; Ebonyi State Broadcasting Corporation generated N5000 and spent N131million whereas Ebonyi State Newspaper Publishing Corporation generated N2500000 and spent N107 million. The implication is that all the enterprises operated at a deficit in 2018. This corroborates the result gotten from the field survey showing that majority of the respondents were of the view that public enterprises have not significantly contributed to revenue generation in Ebonyi State.

Table 6: Revenue Performance of the Selected State-Owned Enterprises in 2019

SN	Enterprise	Actual Revenue Budget	Revenue Generated	Actual Expenditure	Performance Remarks
1	Ebonyi State Transport Corporation	200,000,000.00	None Reported	22,113,412.30	Budget Deficit
2	Ebonyi State Fertilizer & Chemical Company	578,587,714.00	None Reported	55,294,528.83	Budget Deficit
3	Ebonyi State Broadcasting Corporation	137,000,000.00	303,000.00	147,477,027.29	Budget Deficit
4	Ebonyi State Newspaper Publishing Corporation	22,557,554.00	None Reported	14,126,225.91	Budget Deficit

Source: Compiled from the 2019 Audited Financial Statements of Ebonyi State Government, Office of the Auditor-General of Ebonyi State (2023)

The data above showed that the state government spent over two hundred and forty million (N240m) on the four state-owned enterprises in 2019. The table further showed that the state-owned enterprises studied operated on budget deficit for the year ended 2019. None of the enterprises reported any internal revenue within the year under review. Amidst the poor performance: Ebonyi State Transport

Corporation spent N22million; Ebonyi State Fertilizer & Chemical Company spent N55million; Ebonyi State Broadcasting Corporation spent N147million; while Ebonyi State Newspaper Publishing Corporation spent N14 million (see Appendix VI). This corroborates the result gotten from the field survey showing that majority of the respondents were of the view that public enterprises have not significantly contributed to revenue generation in Ebonyi State.

Table 7: Revenue Performance of the Selected State-Owned Enterprises in 2020

SN	Enterprise	Actual Revenue Budget	Revenue Generated	Actual Expenditure	Performance Remarks
1	Ebonyi State Transport Corporation	2,500,000.00	None Reported	52,517,602.30	Budget Deficit
2	Ebonyi State Fertilizer & Chemical Company	16,670,598.00	None Reported	58,812,677.28	Budget Deficit
3	Ebonyi State Broadcasting Corporation	160,983,540.00	None Reported	144,811,286.59	Budget Deficit
4	Ebonyi State Newspaper Publishing Corporation	45,755,063.00	None Reported	34,335,383.47	Budget Deficit

Source: Compiled from the 2020 Audited Financial Statements of Ebonyi State Government, Office of the Auditor-General of Ebonyi State (2023)

The table above shows that the state government spent over two hundred and ninety million (N290) on the four enterprises in 2020. Notwithstanding the enormous financial commitment of the state government, the state-owned enterprises studied all operated on budget deficit for the year ended 2020 as none of them reported any internal revenue within the year under review. Amidst the poor performance: Ebonyi State Transport Corporation spent N52million; Ebonyi State Fertilizer & Chemical Company spent N58million; Ebonyi State Broadcasting Corporation spent N144million; while Ebonyi State Newspaper Publishing Corporation spent N34 million. This corroborates the result gotten from the field survey showing that majority of the respondents were of the view that public enterprises have not significantly contributed to revenue generation in Ebonyi State.

Table 8: Frequency, Percentages, Mean Scores and Standard Deviation of Responses to determine the extent Public Enterprises have contributed to job creation in Ebonyi State

S/N	ITEM	SA 5	A 4	U 3	D 2	SD 1	N	Mean	SD
6	Public enterprises were established to provide jobs opportunities in order to achieve full employment in Ebonyi State	138 (45.7)	109 (36.1)	22 (7.3)	18 (6.0)	15 (5.0)	302 (100%)	4.06	1.23
7	Public enterprises in Ebonyi State have adequately created job opportunities for the unemployed in the state	59 (19.5)	53 (17.5)	41 (13.6)	62 (21.5)	87 (28.8)	302 (100%)	2.78	1.51
8	Public enterprises in Ebonyi State conduct regular and consistent recruitment exercises to promote job creation in the state	50 (16.6)	61 (20.2)	44 (14.6)	69 (22.8)	78 (25.8)	302 (100%)	2.79	1.44
9	Public enterprises in Ebonyi State have been able to diversify their operation to create more rooms for employment of qualified persons in the state	60 (19.9)	42 (13.9)	53 (17.5)	70 (23.2)	77 (25.5)	302 (100%)	2.79	1.47
10	Public enterprises have adequately promoted vocational skill acquisition for self employment in Ebonyi State	49 (16.2)	58 (19.2)	46 (15.2)	73 (24.2)	76 (25.2)	302 (100%)	2.77	1.43

Source: Filed Survey, 2023.

The table above shows the frequency, mean scores and standard deviation of responses to determine the extent to which public enterprises have contributed to job creation in Ebonyi State. The result shows that majority of the respondents were of the opinion that public enterprises have not significantly contributed to job creation in Ebonyi State. Item 6 sought to determine the opinion of the respondents whether public enterprises were established to provide jobs opportunities in order to achieve full employment in Ebonyi State. From their responses, it was revealed that out of a total of 302 respondents, 138 representing 46 percent strongly agreed, 109 respondents representing 36 percent agreed, 22 respondents representing 7 percent were neutral, and 18 representing 6% disagreed whereas 15 respondents representing 5 percent strongly disagreed. Furthermore, the mean score 4.06 was accepted since it was above the decision rule benchmark of 3.0. Moreover, the standard deviation value of 1.23 shows that there is a high degree of similarity in opinion among respondents on the Item 6 concerned. It therefore implies that public enterprises were established to provide jobs opportunities in order to achieve full employment in Ebonyi State.

Item 7 sought to ascertain the view of respondents on whether public enterprises in Ebonyi State have adequately created job opportunities for the unemployed in the state. From the responses, it was discovered that out of the 302 respondents, 59 representing 20 percent strongly agreed, 53 respondents representing 18 percent agreed, 41 respondents representing 14 percent were neutral, and 62 representing 21% disagreed whereas 87 respondents representing 29 percent strongly disagreed. Moreover, the mean value of 2.78 showed that the respondents disagreed since the mean did not reach the benchmark of 3.0 whereas a standard deviation of 1.51 showed that there was high degree of similarity of opinion among the respondents. This implies that majority of the respondents agreed that public enterprises in Ebonyi State have not adequately created job opportunities for the unemployed in the state.

Item 8 sought to ascertain the view of respondents on whether public enterprises in Ebonyi State conduct regular and consistent recruitment exercises to promote job creation in the state. From the responses, it was discovered that out of the 302 respondents, 50 representing 17 percent strongly agreed, 61 respondents representing 20 percent agreed, 44 respondents representing 15 percent were neutral, and 69 representing 23% disagreed whereas 78 respondents representing 26 percent strongly disagreed. Moreover, the mean value of 2.79 showed that the respondents disagreed since the mean did not reach the benchmark of 3.0 whereas a standard deviation of 1.44 showed that there was high degree of similarity of opinion among the respondents. This implies that majority of the respondents were of the view that public enterprises in Ebonyi State do not conduct regular and consistent recruitment exercises to promote job creation in the state.

Item 9 sought to ascertain the view of respondents on whether public enterprises in Ebonyi State have been able to diversity their operation to create more rooms for employment of qualified persons in the state. From the responses, it was discovered that out of the 302 respondents, 60 representing 20 percent strongly agreed, 42 respondents representing 14 percent agreed, 53 respondents representing 18 percent were neutral, and 70 representing 23% disagreed whereas 77 respondents representing 25 percent strongly disagreed. Moreover, the mean value of 2.79 showed that the respondents disagreed since the mean did not reach the benchmark of 3.0 whereas a standard deviation of 1.47 showed that there was high degree of similarity of opinion among the respondents. This implies that majority of the respondents agreed that public enterprises in Ebonyi State have not been able to diversity their operation to create more rooms for employment of qualified persons in the state.

Item 10 sought to ascertain the view of respondents on whether Public enterprises have adequately promoted vocational skill acquisition for self employment in Ebonyi State. From the responses, it was discovered that out of the 302 respondents, 49 representing 16 percent strongly agreed, 58 respondents representing 19 percent agreed, 46 respondents representing 15 percent were neutral, and 73 representing 24% disagreed whereas 76 respondents representing 25 percent strongly disagreed. Moreover, the mean value of 2.77 showed that the respondents disagreed since the mean did not reach the benchmark of 3.0 whereas a standard deviation of 1.43 showed that there was high degree of similarity of opinion among the respondents. This implies that majority of the respondents agreed that public enterprises have not adequately promoted vocational skill acquisition for self employment in Ebonyi State.

Table 9: Frequency, Percentages, Mean Scores and Standard Deviation of Responses to determine the extent Public Enterprises have contributed to improve standard of living of people in Ebonyi State

S/N	ITEM	SA 5	A 4	U 3	D 2	SD 1	N	Mean	SD
11	Public enterprises in Ebonyi State were established to provide quality goods and services for better living conditions of people in Ebonyi State	131 (43.4)	126 (41.7)	28 (9.3)	11 (3.6)	6 (2.0)	302 (100%)	4.21	0.90
12	Public enterprises have ensured that people gain access to portable water supply for improved standard of living in Ebonyi State	60 (19.9)	51 (16.9)	43 (14.2)	62 (20.5)	86 (28.5)	302 (100%)	2.79	1.51
13	Public enterprises in Ebonyi State have enhanced per capita income of people especially in rural areas to improve the living conditions of people in the state	56 (18.5)	48 (15.9)	41 (13.6)	71 (23.5)	86 (28.5)	302 (100%)	2.73	1.48
14	Managers of public enterprises in Ebonyi State have ensured equitable distribution of resources to reduce the sufferings of the poor in the state	52 (17.2)	54 (17.9)	48 (15.9)	68 (22.5)	80 (26.5)	302 (100%)	2.77	1.45
15	Public enterprises have adequately promoted food production to reduce hunger and starvation among the people in Ebonyi State	61 (20.2)	47 (15.6)	42 (13.9)	75 (24.8)	77 (25.5)	302 (100%)	2.83	1.48

Source: Field Survey, 2021.

The table above shows the frequency, mean scores and standard deviation of responses to determine the extent to public Enterprises have contributed to improve standard of living of people in Ebonyi State. The result shows that majority of the respondents agreed that public enterprises have not significantly improved standard of living in Ebonyi State. Item 11 sought to determine the opinion of the respondents whether public enterprises in Ebonyi State were established to provide quality goods and services for better living conditions of people in Ebonyi State. From their responses, it was revealed that out of a total of 302 respondents, 131 respondents representing 43 percent strongly agreed, 126 respondents representing 42 percent agreed, 28 respondents representing 9 percent were neutral, and 11 representing 4 percent disagreed whereas 6 respondents representing 2 percent strongly disagreed. Furthermore, the mean score 4.21 was accepted since it was above the decision rule benchmark of 3.0. Similarly, it was observed that the standard deviation value of 0.90 shows that there is a very high degree of similarity in opinion amongst the respondents on the Item 11 concerned. It therefore implies that public enterprises in Ebonyi State were established to provide quality goods and services for better living conditions of people in Ebonyi State.

Item 12 sought to ascertain the view of respondents on whether Public enterprises have ensured that people gain access to portable water supply for improved standard of living in Ebonyi State. From the responses, it was discovered that out of the 302 respondents, 56 representing 19 percent strongly agreed, 48 respondents representing 16 percent agreed, 41 respondents representing 14 percent were neutral, 71 respondents representing 24% disagreed whereas 86 respondents representing 28 percent strongly disagreed. Moreover, the mean value of 2.73 showed that the respondents disagreed since the mean did not reach the benchmark of 3.0 whereas a standard deviation of 1.48 showed that there was high degree of similarity of opinion among the respondents. This implies that majority of the respondents agreed public enterprises have not ensured that people gain access to portable water supply for improved standard of living in Ebonyi State.

Item 13 sought to ascertain the view of respondents on whether public enterprises in Ebonyi State have enhanced per capita income of people especially in rural areas to improve the living conditions of people in the state. From the responses, it was discovered that out of the 302 respondents, 56 representing 19 percent strongly agreed, 48 respondents representing 16 percent agreed, 41 respondents representing 14 percent were neutral, 71 respondents representing 24% disagreed whereas 86 respondents representing 28 percent strongly disagreed. Moreover, the mean value of 2.73 showed that the respondents disagreed since the mean did not reach the benchmark of 3.0 whereas a standard deviation of 1.48 showed that

there was high degree of similarity of opinion among the respondents. This implies that majority of the respondents were of the view public enterprises in Ebonyi State have not enhanced per capita income of people especially in rural areas to improve the living conditions of people in the state.

Item 14 sought to ascertain the view of respondents on whether managers of public enterprises in Ebonyi State have ensured equitable distribution of resources to reduce the sufferings of the poor in the state. From the responses, it was discovered that out of the 302 respondents, 52 representing 17 percent strongly agreed, 54 respondents representing 18 percent agreed, 48 respondents representing 16 percent were neutral, 68 respondents representing 23% disagreed whereas 80 respondents representing 26 percent strongly disagreed. Moreover, the mean value of 2.77 showed that the respondents disagreed since the mean did not reach the benchmark of 3.0 whereas a standard deviation of 1.45 showed that there was high degree of similarity of opinion among the respondents. This implies that majority of the respondents were of the view that managers of public enterprises in Ebonyi State have not ensured equitable distribution of resources to reduce the sufferings of the poor in the state.

Item 15 sought to ascertain the view of respondents on whether public enterprises have adequately promoted food production to reduce hunger and starvation among the people in Ebonyi State. From the responses, it was discovered that out of the 302 respondents, 61 representing 20 percent strongly agreed, 47 respondents representing 16 percent agreed, 42 respondents representing 14 percent were neutral, 75 respondents representing 25% disagreed whereas 77 respondents representing 26 percent strongly disagreed. Moreover, the mean value of 2.77 showed that the respondents disagreed since the mean did not reach the benchmark of 3.0 whereas a standard deviation of 1.45 showed that there was high degree of similarity of opinion among the respondents. This implies that majority of the respondents were of the view that public enterprises have not adequately promoted food production to reduce hunger and starvation among the people in Ebonyi State.

Summary of Findings

The study made the following findings as summarized:

1. Public enterprises have not significantly enhanced revenue generation in Ebonyi State. State-owned enterprises in Ebonyi State do not generate enough revenue to increase internal revenue earnings of the state government. As such, they do not remit surplus revenue for financing infrastructural projects by the state government. They are unable to generate enough revenue capable of diversifying their operations without dependence on the state government for subvention. This is because revenue made from the sale of goods and services provided by public enterprises are not always adequate to cover their costs of operation in Ebonyi State.
2. Public enterprises have not contributed significantly to job creation in Ebonyi State. Public enterprises have not adequately created job opportunities for the unemployed in the state. They do not conduct regular and consistent recruitment exercises to promote job creation in the state. They have not been able to diversity their operation to create more rooms for employment of qualified persons in the state and have not adequately promoted vocational skill acquisition for self-employment in Ebonyi State.
3. Public enterprises have not significantly improved standard of living of people in Ebonyi State. State enterprises have not ensured that people gain access to portable water supply for improved standard of living in Ebonyi State, have not adequately promoted food production to reduce hunger and starvation among the people in Ebonyi State and have not enhanced per capita income of people especially in rural areas to improve the living conditions of people in the state.

Conclusion

Based on the assessment of the impact of public enterprises on economic development of Ebonyi State and aligning with the findings of the study concluded that public enterprises have not significantly enhanced revenue generation in Ebonyi State. They have not generated enough revenue to increase internal revenue earnings of the state government. As such, they do not remit surplus revenue for financing infrastructural projects by the state government. They are unable to g diversifying their operations without dependence on the state government for subvention. This is because revenue made from the sale of goods and services provided by public enterprises are not always adequate to cover their costs of operation in Ebonyi State. Also, Public enterprises have not contributed significantly to

job creation in Ebonyi State. Public enterprises have not adequately created job opportunities for the unemployed in the state. They do not conduct regular and consistent recruitment exercises to promote job creation in the state. They have not been able to diversify their operation to create more rooms for employment of qualified persons in the state and have not adequately promoted vocational skill acquisition for self-employment in Ebonyi State. And public enterprises have not significantly improved standard of living of people in Ebonyi State. State enterprises have not ensured that people gain access to portable water supply for improved standard of living in Ebonyi State, have not adequately promoted food production to reduce hunger and starvation among the people in Ebonyi State and have not enhanced per capita income of people especially in rural areas to improve the living conditions of people in the state.

6.3 Recommendations

Based on the findings of the study, the following recommendations are therefore made:

1. There is urgent need for Ebonyi State government to reform public enterprises by adopting new public management strategy so they can contribute to revenue generation for economic development of Ebonyi State. In order to implement this suggestion, government has to spur public enterprises managers to adopt new public management approach in the running of public enterprises in the state. One of the most crucial steps is to specify objectives for each public enterprise and monitor their performance based on achievement of the defined objectives. Where a particular state enterprise is expected to pursue both commercial and social objectives at a time, it is logical that their performance especially in terms of revenue generation will suffer. As such, enterprises for social objectives should focus only on social activities whereas enterprises for economic objectives should operate with market orientation and be measured based on their economic performance. There should be clear cut objectives. Without this, results cannot be measured against expectations, while losses can easily be attributed to social goals and poor management thereby concealed.
2. Public enterprise managers should re-strategize by diversifying their operations to create need for more manpower in order to promote job creation in Ebonyi State. To implement this suggestion, public enterprises managers should be able to invest in diverse economic ventures to create need for more manpower. Moreso, they should be able to invest in skill development to enable the unemployed acquire vocational skills, technical skills, business skills and employability skills. This would not only drive formal employment but also boost self employment through entrepreneurship among the unemployed. There is no doubt that government cannot employ everyone but government can ensure that everyone is employed. Job creation can only be achieved through this strategy.
3. Public enterprises managers should intensify efforts through provision of basic necessities like portable water, food and shelter to improve the standard of living of people in Ebonyi State. To implement this suggestion, managers of public enterprises should as a matter of urgency adopt a culture of placing customer's interest first through surveys of citizens' opinion, real needs and inputs and fashion their products or services towards meeting those needs. There is urgent need to invest in provision of basic necessities like portable water, food and shelter including enhancing per capita income of the rural populace. This will eliminate a situation whereby an enterprise like Ebonyi Water Corporation exists while there is no access to portable water supply anywhere in Ebonyi State.

References

- Abah, E.O., Nkwede, J.O. and Nwuzor, C.I. (2017). World Bank assisted community and social development programmes as poverty reduction strategy: a study of rural communities in Ebonyi state, Nigeria. *Middle-East Journal of Scientific Research*, 25 (4): 716-720.
- Abuh, A., Acho, Y., and Peter, U. (2016). Public enterprises management: vehicle for sustainable development in Nigeria. *International Journal of Capacity Building in Education and Management (IJCBEEM)*, 3(1): 46-50.
- Adedigba, A. (2020). JAMB remits N3.5 billion in 2020. Premium Times May 4, 2020. Available at: <https://www.premiumtimesng.com/news/top-news/391250-jamb-remits-n3-5-billion-in-2020.html>. Retrived 4/2/2021.

- Adesulu, D. (2018). JAMB generates N46bn in forms' sales in 6 years. Vanguard Newspaper February 1, 2018. Available at: <https://www.vanguardngr.com/2018/02/jamb-generates-n46bn-forms-sales-6-years/>. Retrived 4/2/2021.
- Agabi, P., and Orokpo, O. (2014). Performance of public enterprises in Nigeria and the privatization option. *International Journal of Public Administration and Management Research (IJPAMR)*, 2(2): 148-155.
- Agashi, E.U. (2021). Effects of entrepreneurial skill acquisition on youth economic development in Ebonyi State: A Study of Ikwo Local Government Area. *Being a research submitted to the Department of Public Administration, Ebonyi State University, Abakaliki. Unpublished.*
- Ahmad, H., and Khan, K. (2013). The role of market orientation and learning orientation in improving innovativeness and performance in small and medium enterprises. *Asian Social Sciences*, 8(1): 134-145.
- Aja-Okorie, U. (2016). Alternative Strategies for Improving Internally Generated Revenue (IGR) of State Universities in Nigeria: Implications for Ebonyi State University (EBSU) Abakaliki. *International Journal of Science and Research (IJSR)*, 5(10): 78-96.
- Alabi, M., Onimisi, U., and Enete, C. (2010). Privatization of public enterprises and Nigeria's stainable development (A Review Article). *Current Research Journal of Social Sciences*, 2(3), 204-208.
- Ali, M., Azarnoosh, A., and Safari, A. (2013). A study of market orientation and Its effect on small to medium sized enterprises of informatics industry located in Tehran. *Journal of Novel Applied Sciences*, 2(5):, 102-112.
- Aliyu, M. (2014). Relationship between market orientation and firm performance: a look at Nigerian SMEs. *Developing Country Studies*, 4(2): 87-93.
- Amadi, Z. (2018). The role of market orientation in public housing companies: A study of MO's effect on construction strategies. Stockholm: Department of Real Estate and Construction Management School of Architecture and the Built Environment Royal Institute of Technology.
- Amadi, K.C. and Alolote, I.A. (2019). Human capital investment as a catalyst for sustainable economic development in Nigeria. *International Journal of management science and business Administration*, 5(5): 13-22.
- Andrews, R., and Steven, V. (2013). New public management and citizens' perceptions of local service efficiency, responsiveness, equity and effectiveness. *Public Management Review*, 1(2): 1-10.
- Anthony-Uko, N. (2018). *State-owned enterprises fail to remit N2.74trn operating surpluses as Nigeria moves to avert revenue crisis*. Online: Business a.m. Available at: <https://www.businessamlive.com/state-owned-enterprises-fail-to-remit-n2-74trn-operating-surpluses-as-nigeria>. Retrieved 4/2/2021.
- Anyadike, N. (2013). The need to make Nigerian public enterprises work. *Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, 18(3): 68-75.
- Ayeni, E.O., Sani, K., Andeshi, C., Ibrahim, I. and Adamu, S. (2021). Job creation and youth empowerment in Nigeria, 2011 – 2020. *Iraqi Journal of Social Sciences*, 2(1): 1-19.
- Asaolu, T. (2015). Privatization in Nigeria: regulation, deregulation, corruption and the way forward. *Journal of Management Policy and Practice*, 14(2): 10-22.
- Ayebe, A. (2018). An assessment of the performance of public enterprise sector in Nigeria. *International Journal of Political Science (IJPS)*, 4(2): 41-46.
- Charbonneau, M. (2012). New public management. In L. Côté, and Savard, J.F. *Encyclopedic Dictionary of Public Administration* (pp. 1-4). online: www.dictionnaire.enap.ca. Retrieved 4/2/2021.
- Chigudu, D. (2015). Aligning profit making organisations' strategy to the public sector for improved performance: market orientation. *Corporate Ownership and Control*, 13(1): 574-582.
- Darabi, Y. (2017). The impact of market orientation on business performance and website adoption: a study among iranian SMEs. *International Marketing Review*, 14(5): 300-323.
- Ede, C. (2016). *Small and medium scale enterprises and economic development in Ebonyi State: a study of Abakaliki Rice Mill*. Abakaliki: Research Submitted to the Department of Public Administration, Ebonyi State University.
- Efe-Imafidon E.O, Ade-Adeniji, O. Umukoro, E. and Ajitemisan M. (2018). Entrepreneurial skill acquisition as a facilitator of self-employability among Nigerian Youths. *Covenant Journal of Entrepreneurship (CJoE)*, 1 (2): 9-19.

- Eme, O. (2012). Internal organizational communication and employees' performance in selected banks in Port Harcourt. *International Journal of Novel Research in Humanity and Social Sciences* 3(3), 77-86.
- Emeh, I. E. (2012). Understanding the poor performance of Nigerian public enterprises focusing on the theories of administrative weaknesses. *Interdisciplinary Journal of Contemporary Research in Business*, 12-21.
- Emerson, W., and Alexandre, S. (2015). Measuring the internal-market orientation in public sector. *Posebno Izdanje*, 339 (35): 53-70.
- Encyclopedia. (2021). *Standard of Living*. Available at: <https://www.encyclopedia.com/social-sciences-and-law/economics-business-and-labor/economics-terms-and-concepts/standard-living>. Retrieved 4/2/2021
- Ezeali, B.O., Uwadi, M.E. and Nwaowu, L.K. (2018). Activities of Ebonyi State Community and Social Development Agency (EB-CSDA) in the development of Ebonyi State, Nigeria (2009-2014). *International Journal of Economic Development Research and investment*, 9(4): 61-79.
- Ezeh, A.N., Nwibo, S.U., Umeh, G.N. and Eze, A.V. (2018). Participation of youth organizations in community development projects in Ivo local government area of Ebonyi State, Nigeria. *Nigerian Agricultural Journal*, 49(2):39-45.
- Ezeudu, T. (2011). *Management of public enterprises in Nigeria: A Case Study of NTA, Awka*. Being a Thesis Submitted to the Department of Public Administration and Local Government, University of Nigeria Nsukka: Unpublished.
- Feldman, M., Hadjimichael, T., and Lanahan, L., and Kemeny, T. (2015). the logic of economic development: a definition and model for investment, Environment and Planning C: *Government and Policy*, 34, 5–21.
- Gromark, J., and Melin, F. (2013). From market orientation to brand orientation in the public sector. *Journal of Marketing Management*, 29: 9-10. Available at: <https://doi.org/10.1080/0267257X.2013.812134>, 1099-1123. Retrieved 4/2/2021
- Hussain, A., Ismail, k., and Akhtar, A. (2015). Market orientation and alternative strategic orientation: a longitudinal assessment of performance implications. *Journal of Marketing*, 66 (2): 25-39.
- Ibieatan, J. (2013). New public management and public service effectiveness in Nigeria: a pragmatic discourse. *Public Policy and Administration Research*, 3(7): 53-61.
- Ibrahim, M., and Ozioma, K. (2019). The impact of internally generated revenue on total expenditure of Gombe State-Nigeria. *International Journal of Economics and Business Administration*, 5(4): 177-184.
- Ikeagwu, L. (2015). *Development Economics*. Lagos: African Press Limited.
- Jeavan, J., and Jyoti, S. (2012). Impact of market orientation on business performance: role of employee satisfaction and customer satisfaction. *Vision*, 16(4): 297-313.
- Johan, G., and Frans, M. (2013). From market orientation to brand orientation in the public sector, *Journal of Marketing Management*, 29:9-10 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/0267257X.2013.812134>, 1099-1123. Retrieved 4/2/2021.
- Kalejaiye, P., Adebayo, K., and lawal, O. (2013). Deregulation and privatization in Nigeria: the advantages and disadvantages so far. *African Journal of Business Management* 7(25): 2403-2409.
- Kenny, S. (2019). The role of public sector enterprise on economic development: a case Study of the Nigerian power sector (1981-2015). *Munich Personal RePEc Archive Online Journal*, 1-11. Retrieved 4/2/2021.
- Kenobi, K. (2015). Public enterprises in Nigeria; a critical evaluation of their performance. Online: <https://www.grin.com/document/338943>, Accessed 20/04/2021.
- Mbah, A., and Onuora, J. K. (2018). Effect of internally generated revenue on infrastructural development of South East States of Nigeria. *IIARD International Journal of Economics and Business Management*, 4(7): 1-10.
- Molander, S., Fellesson, M., and Friman, M. (2018). Market orientation in public service-a comparison between buyers and providers. *Journal of Nonprofit and Public Sector Marketing*, 30(31): 74-94.

- Muktar M. (2018). The role of public enterprises in economic and social development in Nigeria. *Lapai International Journal of Politics*, 5(2): 1-15.
- Musa, D., Iman, A., and Waleed, S. (2012). Antecedents and consequences of market orientation in public sector in the Kingdom Of Bahrain. *International Conference on Business, Economics, Management and Behavioral Sciences (ICBEMBS)*, 7(8): 499-505.
- National Bureau of Statistics (NBS) (2020). Labour force statistics: unemployment and underemployment reports for Q2 2020. Available at: <https://www.nbs.gov.ng>. Retrieved 4/6/2021
- Nnaeto, J.O. and Ndoh, J.A. (2020). Human capital development and sustainable growth in Nigeria: Lessons from East Asia". *Global Journal of Political Science and Administration*, 8(4): 1-20.
- Nnamdi, C., and Nkwede, J. (2014). Managerial challenges of public enterprises; The imperatives for privatization and commercialization of Railway Corporation and Postal Agency in Nigeria. *Global Journal for Research Analysis* 3(8): 191-194.
- Norizan, R., Norhayate, W., Daud, W., and Fakhrul, A. (2017). Market orientation and organizational performance from the resource advantage. *Arabian Journal of Management Review*, 2(1): 89-97.
- Nwali, A., Nwokeiwu, J., and Oganezi, B. (2019). Privatisation of public enterprises in Nigeria: challenges and prospects on economic development. *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences*, 10(4): 131-142.
- Obi-Anike, H.O., Okafor, C.N., and Udejinta, N.B (2017). The role of public enterprises in economic development in Nigeria. *International Journal of Management, IT and Social Sciences*, 4(2): 179-189.
- Odo, S.I., Eze, O.R. and Onyeisi, S.O. (2016). "Analysis of the relationship between human capital development and economic growth in Nigeria. *European Journal of Accounting, Auditing and Financial Research*, 4(3): 56-71.
- Ogohi, D. (2014). Analysis of the performance of public enterprises in Nigeria. *European Journal of Business and Management*, 6(25): 24-32.
- Ojeifo, A., and Alegbeleye, G. (2017). Public enterprise and sustainable socio-economic in Nigeria. *Review of Public Administration and Management*, 4(8): 51-62.
- Okeke, M., Onuorah, A., and Okonkwo. (2016). Managing the challenges of public enterprises in Nigeria and the privatization option. *Kuwait Chapter of Arabian Journal of Business and Management Review*, 5(11): 45-54.
- Okolocha, C.B., John-Akamelu, C.R. and Muogbo, U.S. (2020). Effect of skill acquisition on youth employability in Nigeria. *International Journal of Research and Finance and Management*, 3(1): 33-37.
- Okonkwo, N., and Obidike, C. (2016). Commercialization and privatization policy in Nigeria: a review. *International Journal of Innovative Development and Policy Studies*, 4(1): 45-54.
- Onah, F.N. (2018). Enhancing human capital development through effective health service delivery in Enugu State Nigeria". *International Journal of Advanced Scientific Research and Management*, 3(5): 79-89.
- Onodugo, I., Onodugo, V., Amujiri, B., Asogwa, S., and Anyadike, N. (2015). Improving internally generated revenue (IGR) of South Eastern States of Nigeria: an empirical review of Abia State. *International Journal of Research in Finance and Marketing*, 5(9): 99-118.
- Onyegbule, K. (2017). *Communication and workers' productivity in Nigerian public sector organizations: a study of Akanu Ibiam Federal Polytechnic Unwana*. Abakaliki: A Research Submitted to the Department of Public Administration, Ebonyi State University Abakaliki: Unpublished.
- Onwe, S.O. and Nwakamma, M.C. (2015). Assessment of national poverty reduction programmes in Nigeria: a study of national poverty eradication programme (NAPEP) Ebonyi State". *International Journal of Humanities and Sciences* 5 (2): 227-237.
- Orluwene, O. B., and Selem-Amachree, I. (2017). Privatisation and employment generation in Nigeria: myth or reality (1999-2007). *International Journal of Scientific Research in Education*, 10(5), 474-482.

- Oyewole, T.G. and Adegoke, J.A. (2018). Human capital development in Nigeria: Implications for Nation Building. *International Journal of social sciences and management Research*, 4 (1): 25-34
- Popoola, O., Asaleye, A. J., and Eluyela, D. F. (2018). Domestic revenue mobilization and agricultural productivity: evidence from Nigeria. *Journal of Advanced Research in Law and Economics*, 9(4(34)), 1439-1450
- Rkein, A., and Andrew, B. (2012). Public sector commercial orientation and the social contract: a study of performance management in a non-competitive environment. . *Pacific Accounting Review*, 24(3), 292-313.
- Sallah, A. (2020). *An evaluation of the contributions of public enterprises to socio-economic development of Taraba State* . Zaria: Being a Thesis Submitted To The Department of Public Administration, Post Graduate School, Ahmadu Bello University.
- Stavros, K. (2021). Role of revenue mobilisation in the growth and development of Economy: A Case Analysis of Greece. *Research in World Economy* 12(2): 63-76.
- Udu, L.E. and Onwe, S.O (2016). Approaches to community development in Nigeria, issues and challenges: A study of Ebonyi State Community and Social Development Agency (EB-CSDA): *Journal of Sustainable Development*, 9(1): 296-307.
- Ukoha, I.I., Osuji, M.N., Osuji, E.E. and Ibeagwa, O.P. (2014). Analysis of the influence of the skills acquisition programmes of the National Directorate of Employment on Job creation in Abia State.
- Yamma, A. (2017). *Public enterprises management*. Lagos: NOUN Press.